

©Copyright 2009 with individuals and the Society of Mary

The Marist Series

Through the Marist Series the Society of Mary (Marists) shares projects by Marists in the field of theology and history and works about the role of the Marists in the church, in particular in the Pacific.

Series Editor: Alois Greiler SM

ISBN: 978 1 921551 547

Cover design by Astrid Sengkey

Original photographs:

Front cover

L. Verguet, New Zealand Maori: General Archives of the Society of Mary (Marist Fathers), Rome, Italy and photo of the desk by Bernd Kordes SM, France.

Back cover

'The True Vine': Diocesan Archives of the Catholic Diocese of Auckland, New Zealand; photo taken by Mervyn Duffy SM, Auckland.

ATF Press

An imprint of the Australasian Theological Forum Ltd

PO BOX 504

Hindmarsh

SA 5007

ABN 90 116 359 963

www.atfpress.com

Catholic Beginnings in Oceania

Marist Missionary Perspectives

Edited by Alois Greiler SM



Occorsio, I, *La Figure Juridique de la Congrégation des Sœurs Missionnaires de la Société de Marie, à la Lumière de ses origines et de l'Evolution de son Droit Propre de 1857 à 1931* (thesis, Rome: Pontificiae Universitatis Gregorianae, 1988).

Simmons, E, *Pompallier, Prince of Bishops* (Auckland, CPC, 1984).

The Work of Mary versus the Works of the Devil The Ecclesiology of the Early Marist Missionaries

Mervyn Duffy SM

A missionary is, by definition, someone sent by one group in one place to another people in another location. The Marists were from rural Catholic France and they were sent by the Catholic Church, acting through the agency of Jean-Claude Colin, to the peoples of Western Oceania. This paper is intended as theological rather than historical, it considers how the Marists understood the Church of which they were a part and, from that perspective, how they saw other Christian missionaries and the religious beliefs of the peoples they were sent to. My title is the short answer to the question.¹

The Vicariate of Western Oceania was one of the last great mission territories of the Catholic Church. It was literally on the other side of the planet from Rome, access was difficult and expensive, the vast territory involved was mainly ocean, scattered through it were isolated communities and language groups. The Catholic Church was slow off the mark in launching a mission endeavour to the Western Pacific. Explorers, whalers, sealers and traders had arrived well ahead of the Catholic missionaries. Moreover protestant missionaries were the first to spread the gospel to much of the territory involved. The London Missionary Society was formed in 1795 to send missionaries to Tahiti. In 1813 the Methodists formed the Wesleyan Missionary Society.

As the Marists were planning their mission they were conscious of the presence of the earlier missionaries: As Bishop Pompallier wrote in 1837:² 'A third obstacle one may meet with on the largest islands is the non-Catholic ministers from a whole crowd of sects who make every effort and use every possible method to paralyse the work of the true and legitimate missionaries.'

Notice the terminology employed by Bishop Pompallier. Non-Catholic ministers are of 'a crowd of sects' in contradistinction to the one, true Church. He is a 'true' and 'legitimate' missionary. They are, by implication, false and

1. I have modified the text in response to remarks made during the Suva Conference, August 2008.
2. 'Un troisième obstacle qu'on peut rencontrer dans plusieurs îles importantes, ce sont des ministres non catholiques d'une foule de sectes qui s'efforcent en toutes manières de paralyser les travaux des vrais et légitimes missionnaires.' 9 August 1837, Jean-Baptiste-François Pompallier to Claude du Campe de Rosamel, Archives of Marist Fathers, Rome, OOC 418.1.

illegitimate. The protestant missionaries were considered as an 'obstacle' to the proposed Marist endeavor, expected to be actively engaged in turning the minds of the peoples of Oceania against the Catholic French. Father Colin wrote, in 1839, of an incident in Tahiti: ³ 'One day the protestant missionaries gathered the people in their [Methodist] temple so as to show them by means of a magic lantern the Pope and Catholic priests boiling Protestants in a cauldron.'

The majority of ships travelling to and through the Pacific were commanded by English-speakers from the United Kingdom and North America. The first 'Protestant obstacle' encountered by Pompallier was an American captain at Valparaiso who 'said expressly that they would be careful not to let on board Catholic missionaries for [New Zealand].'⁴

This first group of missionaries had waited months for their passage from Le Havre. The Marists soon learnt that London was a better point of departure for the Pacific. For those who had not previously travelled from their Catholic homeland their first experience of Protestants was at the start of their journey. Brother Attale sums up the experience:⁵

The Christian religion is in a very sorry state in London. The kingdom is riddled with sects - you can count more than eighty different ones. All our belongings and cases are on the ship. Nothing has been lost. A Protestant whose wife is a Catholic has been of great service to us; because he vouched for us, we had only a few of our cases opened by the customs officers. We left

3. 'Un jour les Missionnaires protestants réunirent le peuple dans leur temple, pour lui faire voir au moyen d'une lanterne magique le Pape et les Prêtres Catholiques brûlant les protestants dans une chaudière.' 30 November 1839, Colin to SEM le Maréchal, Duc de Dalmatie, Minister of Foreign Affairs and President of the Council of Ministers, in Gaston Lessard (editor), 'Colin sup'. *Documents concernant le généralat du père Colin*, volume 1, *De l'élection au voyage à Rome (1836-1842)* (Rome, 2007) (= *Colin sup*), 179.
4. 'D'ailleurs la Nouvelle Zélande dans laquelle je croyois pouvoir immédiatement pénétrer ne nous offre aucune occasion favorable. Point de vaisseaux ni de navires qui soient en partance en ce moment pour cette région. A la vérité, il s'en trouve bien un qui est américain, mais il est commandé par des protestants, qui ont dit expressément qu'ils se garderoient bien d'admettre à bord pour cette grande île des missionnaires catholiques.' 17 July 1837, Pompallier to Colin, APM OOC 418.1.
5. July 1839 Brother Attale (John-Baptist Grimaud 1809-47) to Champagnat, in *Correspondance Passive du Père Champagnat*, edited by Aureliano Brambila (Rome, 1993) (= CPC) 163-5. English translation by Edward Clisby.

London on 14 June and set sail at 6 o'clock on the evening of the 15th. There are thirty-six people on board but we are the only Christians. There are two Jews, two blacks, and I think the rest are Protestants.

Again Brother Attale's language is revealing. The multiplicity of Protestant churches is startling for him. It is noteworthy that they receive assistance from a Protestant, but he does mention that the wife is Catholic, implying that she may be the source of this charity. He identifies the group of missionaries as the 'only Christians' on board excluding from that category two Jews, two blacks (were they Muslims?), and lastly the Protestants.

During his first voyage into the Pacific, Pompallier writes to Colin, 'The heretics in these islands exceed us in resources and in all kinds of means.'⁶ This is to be a recurring perception by the Catholic missionaries in Western Oceania, they see themselves as 'the poor relations', as less well-equipped and well-resourced than their Protestant counterparts. Note, too, that Pompallier identifies the Protestants as 'heretics'; he is more accurate than Brother Attale—they are fellow Christians who hold beliefs contrary to what the Catholic Church teaches.

An attitude that the Protestant and Catholic missionaries shared was that a nation state should have a single religion. Neither group promoted plurality of religions. Part of introducing the Christian faith to an island people was to ensure that another faith community did not establish a foothold. Pompallier did not go to Hawaii because, when he called at Tahiti, he heard of the legislation that King Kamehameha III had introduced there:⁷

I, with my chiefs, forbid, by this document that any one should teach the peculiarities of the Pope's religion, nor shall it be allowed to any who teaches these doctrines or those peculiarities to reside in this kingdom; nor shall the ceremonies be exhibited in our kingdom, nor shall any one teaching its peculiarities or its faith be permitted to land on these shores; for it is not proper

6. 'Les hérétiques dans ces îles nous surpassent en ressources et en toutes sortes de moyens.' 28 July 1837, Pompallier to Colin, APM OOC 418-1.
7. 18 December 1837 *An Ordinance Rejecting the Catholic Religion*, Kamehameha III, sovereign of the Sandwich Islands, at Lahaina, Maui. (Kamehameha III reigned 1825-54) Cited in Ralph M Wiltgen, *The Founding of the Roman Catholic Church in Oceania, 1825 to 1850* (Canberra: Australia National University Press, 1979), 150.

that two religions be found in this small kingdom. Therefore we utterly refuse to allow any one to teach those peculiarities in any manner whatsoever. We moreover prohibit all vessels whatsoever from bringing any teacher of that religion into this kingdom . . .

Notice that the motivation given for this legislation, 'that it is not proper that two religions be found in this small kingdom' takes no account of traditional Hawaiian religion.

An experienced missionary of the Paris Foreign Mission Society, Dubois, had advised Pompallier to avoid islands where Protestant missionaries were established.⁸ It was hearing of a proposed Methodist mission which inspired Pompallier to start his first mission on the islands of Futuna and Wallis. He wanted the Catholics to be the first missionaries there and to pre-empt and prevent the Protestant mission. As he told Colin they were 'encore intactes.'⁹ It is as if the Pacific Ocean were a giant 'Go' board with island communities as stones.

Dubois had advised that New Zealand was so big that the Protestants could not have penetrated all of it. What was played out in the Pacific island by island was to be replicated on the tighter stage of New Zealand tribe by tribe. The first things done in a mission may well prove to be a mistake due to inescapable inexperience or not listening to wise advice. Le Havre was the wrong port to depart from; they waited months for a ship there while on the other side of the channel, ships were departing for the Pacific every week. According to Jan Snijders they sailed the wrong way around the planet.¹⁰ The journey took a very long time even for that period. In my opinion, they also finished the journey at a wrong place. They landed and established a mission station on the Hokianga

8. Dubois to Meynis, 14 September 1836, Archives of the Propagation of the Faith (= APFL), 1836, Paris Divers.
9. 'Les îles de Wallis et de Fortuna, encore intactes, étoient sur le point de recevoir des ministres hérétiques; je me suis empressé d'y placer les p(ères) Chanel et Bataillon pour prendre pied avant ceux-là.' 14 mai 1838, Pompallier to Colin, APM OOc 418.1.
10. Jan Snijders, *A Piety Able to Cope: Jean-Claude Colin and the Marist Missions in Oceania* (private publication, 2007), 40-1. 'The contacts in Le Havre confirmed what Pastre had already pointed out in September 1835 and what Pompallier must have learned from Coudrin in August, 1836, that is, that there were better ways to go to Oceania than around Cape Horn and via Valparaiso. A shipping agent pointed out that there was more regular and faster shipping from English ports directly to the Pacific.'

Harbour. The contemporary Hocken map¹¹ records sixteen Methodist chapels around the Hokianga. Recognising this, and the problems of access, Pompallier moved his centre of activities to the Bay of Islands. Brother Pierre-Marie was surprised by one town having a mix of religions:¹² 'The place where we live in New Zealand is called the Bay of Islands and the town is called Kororareka. Although small it has a mixture of Catholics, Protestants, and undecided.'

The surviving Marist building at Kororareka is the printery. Even this was motivated, in part, by what Protestants had done:¹³

I just arranged to buy a small press to copy letters. That is the advice of the [Paris] Foreign Mission Society and of the Picpus [Fathers] that the Society of Mary would do better to train a few people in the old way of printing and to send out a letterpress with the next group of missionaries. We must not forget that a press of that kind is most useful in our countries where the Methodists make use of it to circulate their heretical teachings.

This brings to light a characteristic of the Oceania mission. Many of the people being evangelised were literate. The Maori had embraced reading with great

11. *Map of the Hokianga Harbour*, nd (HM 841, Hocken Library, special collections Otago University library). In 1823 the Wesleyan Missionary Society joined the Church Missionary Society in the Northern region of New Zealand. Initially a mission station was established at Whangaroa Harbour, against the advice of Hongi Hika and subsequently this station was abandoned in 1827. The Wesleyans were then re-established in and around the Hokianga Harbour in 1828 under the protection of the Rangatira (Chief) Patuone. This map of the Hokianga Harbour shows the number of Wesleyan Chapels in the Hokianga as well as the extent of cultivations in the area. See this map on http://www.library.otago.ac.nz/exhibitions/he_tirohanga_ki_muri/taitokerau.html
12. 20 May 1842. Brother Pierre-Marie to Brother Francois. Bay of Islands, Kororareka, *Lettres d'Océanie N. 0 1836-1894*, edited by Edward Clisby (=LO) 34.
13. 28 November 1836, Pompallier to Colin, APM OOc 418.1: 'Je n'ai donc fait acheter qu'une petite presse à copier les lettres. On est d'avis aux missions étrangères et aux Picpus que la Société de Marie feroit mieux de former quelques sujets à l'ancienne méthode d'imprimerie et d'emporter au prochain envoi de missionnaires une imprimerie à caractères. N'oublions pas qu'une presse de ce genre est de la plus grande utilité pour nos pays où les méthodistes en font usage pour faire circuler leurs doctrines hérétiques.'

enthusiasm. Jumping ahead in time briefly, here is Brother Luc's (*1813) description of the scene after the establishment of the mission printery:¹⁴

Yet they [the Maori] are very good to us and well disposed towards the Catholic religion which they embrace in daily increasing numbers, especially since we have given them books. When we first arrived they were quite cool towards us and told all the priests they were going to give up praying unless they were given books. But, thanks be to God for this, they now leave the 'missionaries' (as they call the Protestants) in great numbers and come to receive instruction and baptism. On their side, the missionaries do all they can to deceive once more these people who had been too ready to believe them, but they are not listening to them any more. Sometimes they confound them with their astonishing replies; even well-instructed Europeans would often find it difficult to come up with the like. It is to be hoped that she who is strong as an army in battle array will crush the demons and their allies and it will not be said that the Marists are weaker than the devil. Mary, our good mother, is at our head and she is supported by the arms of the Almighty. Who then can triumph against such odds?

14. 1 November 1843, Brother Luc Macé to Colin, Bay of Islands, APM Z 208: 'Ils sont néanmoins très bons envers nous et bien disposés pour la religion catholique, qu'ils embrassent tous les jours de plus en plus, surtout depuis qu'on leur a donné des livres: car quand nous arrivâmes ils étoient bien refroidis et disoient à tous les pères qu'ils alloient abandonner la prière puisqu'on ne leur donnoit pas de livres. Mais grâces en soient rendues à Dieu, maintenant ils quittent en grand nombre les mission(nai)res (c'est ainsi qu'on nomme les protestans) et viennent se faire instruire et bathiser. Les miss(ionnaires) de leur côté font ce qu'ils peuvent pour tromper de nouveau ces peuples qui ont été trop crédules à leurs voix; mais ils ne les écoutent pas beaucoup. Quelquefois ils poussent les miss(ionnaires) à bout par des réponses étonnantes que souvent des Européens, même instruits, auraient peine à trouver. Il faut espérer que celle qui est forte comme une armée rangée en bataille terrassera les démons et ses suppôts; et qu'il ne sera pas dit que les Maristes ont été plus faibles que le démon. Marie, notre bonne mère, est à notre tête; elle est soutenue par le bras du tout-puissant; quel est celui qui pourroit vaincre avec de tels combattans.' Translation by Edward Clisby (editor), *Letters from Oceania: Letters of the First Marist Brothers in Oceania 1841-1843* (= LO), 100-1.

Notice that the Marist missionaries arrived to find the word 'missionary' taken. Missionary (*Mihinari* in Maori) meant protestant. They also encountered an intelligent, articulate argumentative people. Maori welcomed new ideas and were prepared to debate them endlessly. They happily played the ideas of the Catholics off against the Protestants and vice-versa. They were not passive recipients of evangelisation; they wanted to test the ideas and character of these foreigners. This letter to Father Colin reveals a very militant analogy. Brother Luc understands himself and his Marist confreres as being engaged in a war against the Devil and his allies, in this context clearly the Protestant ministers. Meanwhile, on their part, the Marists see themselves as fighting in the company of Mary, under her leadership in this combat. It is from this phrase that I have drawn the title of this paper.

This understanding of Mary as leading in battle against Protestants is a thread of Marist spirituality running back to Jean-Claude Courveille's (1787-1866) inspiration at Le Puy. He recounted to Father Gabriel-Claude Mayet (1809-94) the 'words' of Mary from that event including this passage:¹⁵

I am like a powerful army, defending and saving souls. When a fearful heresy threatened to convulse the whole of Europe, my Son raised up His servant, Ignatius, to form a Society under His name, calling itself the Society of Jesus, with members called Jesuits, to fight against the hell unleashed against His Church. In the same way in this last age of impiety and unbelief, it is my wish and the wish of my Son, that there be another Society, on consecrated to me, one which will bear my name, which will call itself the Society of Mary and whose members will call themselves Marists, to battle against hell.

This is a foundational image for Marists, one they would have learnt in their novitiate. However it is metaphoric language. Brother Luc is using the image of battle rather than intending to attack the next Protestant he sees. This is a 'war' which is to be fought with images.

15. Edwin Keel (editor), *A Book of Texts for the Study of Marist Spirituality* (Rome, 1993), Doc 1, 5 (c December 1853), Mayet/Courveille narrative on the origins of the Society of Mary, based on letters of Dom Courveille of 1852, in Jean Coste and Gaston Lessard (editors), *Origines Maristes*, 4 volumes (Rome, 1960-1967) (= OM), Doc 718, 5. Courveille does go on to say 'I heard no words. It all happened inwardly, in my heart.'

The well-resourced Methodists had their magic lantern show, Pompallier and the Marists brought a visual aid of their own to show the truth of the Catholic Church and the fate of heretics. This was a large printed poster, backed on canvas, of the *True Vine*.¹⁶ It is custom made for them. It would have been an expensive printing plate to have engraved. It is not something done lightly. It is designed for the situation they knew they were going to encounter.¹⁷ It existed in multiple copies. One survives in the archives of the Auckland Diocese. The copy we have has a few alterations, presumably by the hand of Pompallier. It provides a key to understanding the mindset of the first missionaries and how it was changed by what they encountered. This is my Rosetta Stone for understanding the ecclesiology of the Marists and how, for Pompallier at least, it changed in the first few years of Mission.

Before describing it in detail, here is an account of it being used. The incident was a debate between Father Chouvet (*1814) and Reverend Mr JH Awilson, a missionary of the Anglican Church, at Opotiki, in October 1844:¹⁸

We unrolled in front of the natives a big chart which has as a title The Tree of the Church. Then we showed them on this chart the establishment of the Church by our Lord Jesus Christ, the choice that the divine master made of Saint Peter as leader or pope, and the uninterrupted government of this same Church by the successors of Saint Peter down to Gregory XVI, who was then reigning. We called this tree the ladder of the Catholics,

16. The poster must date from after 1835 and be produced for Pompallier since it features Western Oceania. Chouvet refers to it being used in New Zealand in 1844, hence it must date from before then and have time to get to New Zealand from France. The most likely scenario is that it was prepared for the first missionary group in 1836, but, even if it is produced later, it reflects the French missionaries' understanding of the Church, prior to their experience of the New Zealand situation.

17. The imagery of the poster is reflected in several paragraphs of the letter that Pompallier wrote to Colin on 26 November 1840 (LRO, Doc 80) detailing what he had been preaching to the Maori. For example in paragraph 11 'Il n'y a qu'une vraie église, où l'on puisse avoir Dieu pour père et se sauver. C'est l'église appelée catholique romaine, c'est l'église mère instituée de Dieu et non par les hommes, c'est l'église tronc dont les branches sont étendues par toute la terre, et l'ont été dans tous les âges . . . ' and his reference to the other churches as 'comme des branches coupées' in paragraph 13.

18. *A Marist Missionary in New Zealand 1843–1846* by Father JAM Chouvet, 70–1.

by means of which they could go back to Saint Peter, and consequently, to Jesus Christ, the originator and object of our faith. I read out loud the names of all the popes written on this chart. This reading charmed the natives who are very fond of genealogical recitals, and vie with each other as to who can recite the greatest number of known ancestors' names. This long list of about two hundred and fifty Popes was listened to with unflinching patience, or rather, with extraordinary curiosity. The natives had never heard such a long, and, in their eyes, such a glorious genealogy, even though it was of the spiritual order.

The poster illustrates the biblical theme of the Church as a vine. Christ is shown crucified at the base with a pastiche of texts from John 15 on a scroll beneath him: 'I am the true vine' (15:1a) 'Whoever remains in me bears fruit in plenty.' (15:5b) 'Those who do not bear fruit will be cut away.' (cf 15:2b)¹⁹ The branches are the various mission territories of the Church; from the places that Jesus visited during his public ministry to the recently founded dioceses of America and finally at the top of the vine the region of Oceania. Pompallier's territory, the Vicariate of Western Oceania, is the last shoot on the vine. The fruits of the vine are saints, often the founding saint of a diocese; Lyon and Saint Irenaeus are conspicuously worn on the surviving example in the Auckland Archives. Clearly, the missionaries had tapped this spot to indicate the church community that they had come from. The vine is growing up towards the Trinity in heaven. Saints on clouds surround the Trinity, with the Virgin Mary being closest to Jesus. Running, like a ladder, up the trunk of the vine is a list of the Popes. The printed list goes from Saint Peter to Gregory XVI. Alongside the trunk are some twenty Councils of the Church from Jerusalem to Trent.

The list of councils on the *True Vine* is unusual in three respects. Firstly it starts with Jerusalem, which is not usually considered a General Council, however, it is scriptural, and thus hard for the Protestants to deny. Once they accept the existence and authority of one council they would have to explain which others they accepted and if not, why not. The second respect is the presence of three councils that do not fit Roman definitions of a general council: Pisa, Constance and Basel. This is evidence of Gallican Theology, of Conciliarism, the teaching that the authority of a General Council is greater than that of the Pope. This was strong in France, but interestingly, very much opposed by Jean-Claude Colin.

19. The text on the poster is 'JE SUIS LA VRAIE VIGNE / Celui qui demeure en moi porte beaucoup de Fruit. Celui qui ne demeure pas en moi sera retranché.' A third longer line of text beneath those two is now unreadable.

He ensured that later Marists were formed in ultra-montane theology which stressed the supremacy of papal authority. They produce council lists like that in J Gaume's, 1845 *Catéchisme de Persévérance*, which was also brought out to New Zealand by Pompallier.²⁰ The third difference is the absence of two of the five Lateran Councils, which I signal as odd without being able to provide a motivation.

Down both sides of the poster, branches that have been trimmed away are falling. Each of these has a name on it, some are philosophers like Hobbes, Rousseau and Voltaire, others are Christian movements and their founders like Presbyterians, Calvinists and Calvin, Anglicans and Henry VIII. These severed branches drop towards a depiction of hell where devils with pitchforks await. This is based upon John 15:6 'Anyone who does not remain in me is thrown away like a branch—and withers; those branches are collected and thrown on the fire and are burnt.'

The poster was intended as an illustration to accompany preaching, not a substitute for it. An indication of what would be said in association with the poster is given by Pompallier, in a handwritten book *Instructions for the Works of the Mission*.²¹

The important phrase to use in reply, and to uphold everywhere, is: The Roman Catholic Church is the living tree. *Ko te tahi take ko te rakau ora o te atua* [the one foundation is the staff of God]. The new Churches are the severed branches. *Ko nga manga ruatiia* [the severed branches]. The Roman Catholic Church is the original Church, the trunk Church, the Church of all times and all places. *Te hahi katorika romana ko te hahi tawito, ko te hahi matua, ko te hahi take, ko te hahi o nga tau katoa me nga wahi katea a te wenua*: [The Roman Catholic Church is the old Church, the parent Church, the original Church, the Church of all times and all places].²²

20. J Gaume, *Catéchisme de Persévérance* (Paris, 1845), 440: 'On compte dix-huit conciles généraux: deux de Nicée, quatre de Constantinople, un d'Ephèse, un de Chalcédoine, cinq de Latran, deux de Lyon, un de Vienne, un de Florence et un de Trente.' This corresponds exactly to modern lists like that given by Norman Tanner, *Decrees of the Ecumenical Councils* (Georgetown, 1990). Pompallier's copy of this catechism is held by the Colin Library at Good Shepherd College in Auckland, New Zealand.

21. J Pompallier, *Instructions pour les Travaux de la Mission*, 89 handwritten pages, dated 1841, Auckland Diocesan Archive, English citations from the unpublished translation by Kerry Bernice Girdwood-Morgan.

22. Pompallier, *Instructions*, 51.

So, under the banner of Mary, the Marists arrived in New Zealand ready to do battle with Protestants for the souls of the Maori people. At least in image, they were prepared to consign heretics to hell. There is evidence, however, that their ecclesiology adapted to their new context.

This copy of the poster of the *True Vine* has several emendations: one name, four numbers and two pieces of paper stuck on.

The added name is that of Pius IX at the top of the list of Popes. This is a natural addition to make once the news of his taking up the office in 1846 reached New Zealand. No subsequent pope has been added so the poster was no longer 'in use' by 1878.

Alongside four of the councils there is a hand-written number. These are the traditional numbers of bishops that attended each of the councils concerned. I suggest that this was the hand of Pompallier and he was explaining the importance and number of bishops in the Church. 'I am one Bishop, at this great Council of Nicea there were 318 like me!' This wasn't considered important when the chart was first designed, but realizing the advantage he had as the only bishop in New Zealand, Pompallier presented a view of the Church in which bishops were very important in its governance and teaching. This accords with his *Instructions*, 'The Holy Spirit set the Bishops to rule the Assembly of God. Thus he who fails the apostles' successors fails God Himself.'²³

The pieces of paper were stuck on to cover over hell, the glue marks and the shadow of where they were is evident on the poster in the Auckland Diocesan Archives. Thus, at some point, it was no longer judged appropriate to imply that Protestants were going to hell. This may have corresponded in time to the 1841 *Instructions* because, for their period of history, they show remarkable ecumenical tolerance.²⁴

Be steadfast in controversy, but gentle and honest in your approach. To be steadfast means you must have at your grasp all the arguments of the Church against the errors of the pretended reformers and especially against their major error, of which we have spoken. To be good in form is to act inwardly with a pure zeal for saving your neighbour's soul. It is to love warmly, in the Lord. It is to have a care to curb one's pride and self-love. It is to avoid engaging in a dispute in anger or too much emotion, and not using hateful terms—in other words, attacking error without wounding the one who errs. You must, through charity,

23. Pompallier, *Instructions*, 34.

24. Pompallier, *Instructions*, 81–2.

or at least prudence, suppose that your opponent is in good faith, and inwardly recommend yourself and your erring neighbour to the Lord. Silently invoke the protection of Mary, the Queen of the Church and powerful Virgin, who will one day rejoice at the triumph over all the heresies in the whole world. Frequently offer Holy Sacrifice as a Memento for the conversion of those who err.

In conversations and social dealings with them, bring up several principles which might shed some light and save them. When they engage you in conversation on matters of religion, listen to them with interest and join in a friendly discussion if you see that that is their inclination.

Pompallier wants his missionaries to love warmly their Protestant counterparts, to offer mass for them, to join in friendly discussion with them, and to avoid wounding them in dispute. That would fit with hell being covered over, but also raises the question of what happened between the commissioning of the poster (between 1835 and 1839) and the writing of the *Instructions* (1841)? The most obvious event in the history of New Zealand is the signing of the Treaty of Waitangi (1840), a foundational event for the country, and something perceived as a major event in its own time. Pompallier, being French and Catholic, was perceived by the Maori as independent of the British crown with whom they were negotiating the Treaty. He was widely consulted in the period leading up to the signing. He was concerned about the effect the Treaty might have on the status of the Catholic Church in New Zealand.

At the first signing of the Treaty, Pompallier and William Colenso, an Anglican missionary, recorded a discussion on religious freedom and customary law. In answer to a direct question from Pompallier, Governor Hobson agreed to the following statement. It was read to the meeting in Maori and English before any of the chiefs had signed the Treaty:²⁵ 'E mea ana te Kawana ko nga whakapono katoa o Ingarani, o nga Weteriana, a Roma, me te ritenga Maori hoki e tiakina ngatahitia e la—The Governor says the several faiths of England, of the Wesleyans, of Rome, and also the Maori custom shall alike be protected by him.'

25. The significance of this statement is disputed. It was recorded by the missionary witnesses but not in Governor Hobson's official despatches. Maori, being an oral culture, gave it greater weight than the European settlers who focussed on the written text of the Treaty.

Conclusion

We are proud of what Pompallier and Servant (1808–60) contributed to the Treaty of Waitangi, but we usually fail to see just how far these Catholic churchmen have come as a result of their dialogue with the chiefs, with Colenso and with Governor Hobson. I suggest that the Treaty dramatically changed their ecclesiology. If the Governor were to guarantee to treat alike the several faiths, then the Catholics have to accept a likeness among those faiths. Well in advance of the second Vatican Council Pompallier had got to the point of recognising virtue in his protestant counterparts.

The Marist missionaries changed New Zealand, but contact with the Maori and with Protestant ministers changed the Marists, too. We now stress Mary as Mother of Mercy rather than as our leader in battle. We are not as quick to send people to hell as we were in our first fervour of leaving France to save the peoples of Oceania. In New Zealand, we have never printed a Catholic Maori Bible, it has always been simpler and more economic to use and supplement the widely available Protestant translation.

We have *The True Vine* and the *Instructions* of Pompallier as an example of a truly Marist missiology.²⁶ Today we can benefit from the vision expressed there of a Church founded by Jesus Christ which yet recognizes good faith outside its own boundaries, returns courtesy for calumnies, and knows that Catholics have no monopoly of the Holy Spirit.

26. It may also be Colinian; Jean Coste (editor), *A Founder Speaks*, Rome, 1975, Doc 134, 1: 'Round about November 1846 Father Colin said on one occasion, 'Missioners, all Marists, must be men who are grafted into Christ, and follow no will but his, just as the shoot springing from the main branch has no life of its own, other than the sap which comes to it from the vine. If it is cut off from that sap, from its vine, it dies, and it is the same with us'. Colin applies the vine and branches image firstly to Missioners.